PROGRESS REPORT ON THE DELIVERY OF THE NPP GOVERNMENT’S ELECTION PROMISES (2017-2020)

December, 2019
# Contents

List of Figures ............................................................................................................................................ 3
List of Abbreviations ................................................................................................................................. 3
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ............................................................................................................................ 5
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................................ 7
METHODOLOGY ........................................................................................................................................ 8
  Setting out the Yardstick .......................................................................................................................... 8
  Identification of Themes for the Formulation of the Framework .......................................................... 9
  The Framework ....................................................................................................................................... 10
  Scoring and Aggregation ......................................................................................................................... 12
  Limitations of the Methodology ............................................................................................................ 13
  Overall Performance of the NPP Government ......................................................................................... 13
ECONOMY (54.6%) .................................................................................................................................. 15
  ECONOMY, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (47.96%) .................................................................................. 15
  TOURISM, CULTURE AND CREATIVE ARTS (66.19%) ...................................................................... 17
  AGRICULTURE (60%) ............................................................................................................................ 18
HUMAN CAPITAL INVESTMENT (39%) ..................................................................................................... 21
  EDUCATION (45%) ................................................................................................................................. 21
  HEALTH (33%) ...................................................................................................................................... 23
SOCIAL SECTOR (43.78%) ........................................................................................................................ 26
INFRASTRUCTURE (46.44%) ..................................................................................................................... 29
  ENERGY SECTOR (43.78%) .................................................................................................................... 29
  Lands and Natural Resources (54.6%) ................................................................................................... 33
  STRUCTURAL DEVELOPMENT (47.75%) ............................................................................................. 34
  SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND ENVIRONMENT (29.25%) ......................................... 39
GOVERNANCE (46.2%) ............................................................................................................................ 41
  Governance, Corruption and Public Accountability .............................................................................. 42
  Local Government ................................................................................................................................. 43
  Security and Foreign Affairs .................................................................................................................. 44
  Chieftaincy, Religious Affairs and Civil Society .................................................................................... 45
References ............................................................................................................................................... 46
List of Figures

Figure 1. iManifesto Scoring Scale ......................................................... 11
Figure 2; Simplified Scoring Matrix ....................................................... 12
Figure 3. Scores for Economy, Trade and Industry ..................................... 16
Figure 4: Scores for Agriculture .............................................................. 20
Figure 5: Scores for Education ................................................................. 22
Figure 6: Scores for Health ....................................................................... 24
Figure 7: Score for Social Sector ............................................................... 27
Figure 8: Score for Governance ............................................................... 41

List of Abbreviations

AU African Union
CRC Constitutional Review Committee
DACF District Assemblies Common Fund
CDD Ghana Centre For Democratic Development
CHPS Community-based Health Planning Services
CSO Civil Society Organization
DCE District Chief Executive
FCUBE Free Compulsory Universal Basic Education
GDP Gross Domestic Product
IMMA Manifesto Assessment Framework
IAT IMANI Assessment Team
LEAP Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty
LI Legislative Instrument
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

As the country prepares for the general election in 2020, it is almost inevitable that, the political parties and their respective flagbearers will commence an active engagement of citizens, making commitments to arrest the myriad of challenges confronting Ghanaians, ranging from the management of the economy to improving their socio-cultural status while guaranteeing to provide security - all of which are essential needs and expectations of citizens. Against this background, it is important that, an assessment of the progress made by the current government in fulfilling the myriad of commitments it made in 2016 which secured what is considered by many as an unprecedented victory at the ballot in the 4th Republic, is conducted to gauge the level of performance. This assessment is necessary not only because it will provide citizens a tool to demand accountability from government and various political actors, it will ensure that:

1. the government will keep a tab on the commitments it may not have executed to date
2. the government will consolidate its accountability mechanisms in documenting and reporting on all initiatives that it has undertaken, particularly those it committed to in its manifesto and crucially
3. a basis is provided for a national discourse on sensitive issues which fall through the cracks during policy design and implementation

The 2019 iManifesto is a report that presents the status of implementation of the promises of the 2016 New Patriotic Party (NPP) manifesto. This is not an impact assessment report, but an assessment of the state of implementation of the NPP’s promises aimed at “creating prosperity and equal opportunities for all”. This assessment does not take into account activities, initiatives, programmes and policies which the government did not promise, but has undertaken them due to either (i) exigencies of the time, or (ii) prudent management. It is the expectation of the reviewers that, this approach will ensure that political parties and subsequently government will aim to appropriately gauge the associated risks of implementing their promises made to citizens, which could lead to a reduction in the sensationalism, associated with some commitments made by political parties. **Working close to reality is KEY!**

To accomplish the task, an assessment framework is developed. For consistency in measurements through time, this framework has been used in assessments for previous governments, with marginal modifications, due to (i) nature of promises made and (ii) availability of information for verifying claims of implementation. This year’s assessment is structured along five themes – which account for all the promises made by the NPP government in 2016. The themes include; Economy, Governance, Infrastructure, Human Capital Investment, and social services.

Collecting data from the 2016 NPP manifesto, all main and supplementary budgets by the government to date, annual progress reports, auditor general’s reports, reports of statutory bodies such as the public interest and accountability committee, parliamentary
Hansards, websites of various Ministries, Departments and Agencies MDAs, newspapers and news portals, the results show that, the government has achieved an overall performance on executing its manifesto commitment of **48.78 percent**. This is a satisfactory progress, according to the IMANI MANIFESTO ASSESSMENT (IMMA) Framework, although it sits in the lower bounds of this interpretation. Disaggregating this performance, the NPP government scores, **54.35 percent** in the delivery of its commitments on the economy, **46.21 percent** on governance, and **46.44 percent** on infrastructure. The government scores **39.13 percent** and **43.78 percent** on human capital development and social services respectively. Clearly, the aggressive strategy of the government in driving the agriculture industry is seen in its commitment to ensuring that it pushes through most of its promises to “resuscitate” the sector, with positive results registered in some value chains. It is also a progressive sign to see that, performances in the economy, education and infrastructure, are all pushing the median mark of execution. Health and information technology require significant attention. With the final budget of the government having been presented, a window of opportunity exists for further considerations to ensure these themes also see some marked improvements.

A key observation from the data is that, there appears to be an aggressive strategy by the government in ensuring that its manifesto promises are fulfilled. **70 percent** of all its manifesto promises have featured in policy design with varying levels of implementation, and the IMMA score adjusts for actual performance. Manifesto promises which have seen complete implementation make up about **27 percent** of the total commitments made by the NPP in 2016.

It is of utmost importance to appreciate the drag that the number of promises can have on the performance of a government. To this end, political parties in Ghana capable of winning general elections must be realistic, in making commitments to citizens to ensure they can adequately perform and subsequently leverage this as a basis for securing further mandates of governance.

The quality of implementation and impact of the promises as indicated, is not the primary focus of this report. Imani Centre for Policy and Education hopes this report will be interpreted accordingly to ensure this body of work supports the public discourse of manifesto preparation and demand side accountability mechanisms.
INTRODUCTION

IMANI’s iManifesto assessments of the ability of elected governments to substantially deliver on the commitments they make to their constituents have become a necessary activity on the Ghanaian electoral calendar.

The assessment in the case of successive Ghanaian governments since 2008, has taken the shape of (i) assessment of the manifesto’s ability to transform the Ghanaian economy along some baseline parameters, (ii) an interim (midterm) assessment of the winning party’s commitment to the manifesto, and (iii) a final assessment of the execution of promises over the term of the government, considering various opportunities and threats the government could have been exposed to, domestic or internationally. The final assessment provides the basis for understanding the state of key sectors of the economy, prior to an election, which corroborates the expectations of citizens.

The Nana Addo Dankwa Akufo-Addo led government has travelled three out of four years of its time in office, pursuing various policies and reforms some of which it believed to be core to the delivery of the ‘Ghana Beyond Aid’ agenda.

On behalf of all the hard working team that put this report together, IMANI presents its penultimate assessment of the commitment of the NPP government to the delivery of its 2016 manifesto promises. The 2019 iManifesto aimed to score the performance of the government and explore how major policy initiatives carried the ordinary Ghanaian along in pursuit of their own economic advancement, with particular emphasis on delivery of sustainable jobs through a systemic approach and recovery of the economy, and improvement in governance.

IMANI will aim to present a final score card in 2020.
METHODOLOGY

This assessment uses a content analysis and codification approach to assess the NPP’s 2016 manifesto, “Change: An Agenda for Jobs, Creating Prosperity & Equal Opportunity for All”. The assessment is based on the methodology of the previous iManifesto assessments of political parties. It is worth mentioning that the purpose of this assessment is to carry out an output-based assessment and not an impact-based assessment. In effect, the analysis covers the deliverables promised in the 2016 manifesto of the NPP. The final score is arrived at through the process outlined in the subsequent sections.

Setting out the Yardstick

The manifesto of the ruling party provides an objective basis for assessing the output-based performance of the promises made during the 2016 campaign. The 2016 manifesto of the NPP serves as a framework within which other promises and political communiqué are made. Adams, Ezrow, and Somer-Topcu (2011) posits that the manifesto-based policy statements of political parties roughly reflects policies that are communicated to the public through avenues such as campaign platforms, press conferences, media interviews and in party elites’ campaign speeches. In setting out the yardstick for assessment in line with the proposition of Adams Ezrow and Sumer Topcu (2011), it is important to answer the following questions;

i. What promises have been made under each category and sub-category identified in the manifesto?
ii. Are they fully or partially implemented?

For example, in the 2016 manifesto of the NPP, “Change: An Agenda for Jobs, Creating Prosperity & Equal Opportunity for All”, the party under the Economy theme promised to “abolish[ing] the Special Import Levy”. To assess this promise, various policy documents such as the national budget, annual progress reports, information portals and websites of ministries, departments and agencies, parliamentary hansards, news reports, and other sources for verification. In this case, the 2017 budget captured the abolishment of the 1 percent Special Import Levy, without any further adjustments being made in subsequent budgets and economic management policies and directives of government. This then serves as the basis for scoring the performance of the government on the promise.
Identification of Themes for the Formulation of the Framework

The 2016 manifesto of the NPP has been structured based on 18 chapters. Specifically, the manifesto is structured under the following:

1. A Strong Economy Matters
2. Trade and Industry
3. Energy and Petroleum
4. Agriculture and Rural Development
5. Growing Together
6. Infrastructure
7. Natural Resources-Land, Forestry and Mining
8. Science, Technology, Innovation and Environment
9. Education
10. Health
11. Social Development
12. Governance, Corruption and Public Accountability
13. Local Government
14. Security
15. Foreign Affairs
16. Youth and Sports
17. Tourism, Culture and Creative Arts
18. Chieftaincy, Religious Affairs and Civil Society

Out of these chapters identified in “Change: An Agenda for Jobs, Creating Prosperity & Equal Opportunity for All”, we identified key sectors and subsumed areas to construct the assessment. The following sections have been identified based on the framework of the previous iManifesto reports:

i. Economy (ECO) (assessment of promises under Chapters 1, 2, 4, 17),
ii. Human Capital Investment (HCI) (assessment of promises under Chapters 9 and 10),
iii. Social Policy (assessment of promises under Chapter 11)
iv. Infrastructural Development (assessment of promises under Chapters and 8).
v. Governance (GOV) (assessment of the promises under Chapters 12, 13, 14, 15, & 18),

This assessment includes relevant contemporary policy choices that are important for sustainable development. Specifically, themes on science, technology, innovation, environment are captured as a result of their importance in line with global policy directions around sustainable development. The human capital development theme combine education and health as used in developing the World Bank's Human Capital Index (Kraay, 2019).
The Framework

This year’s assessment adapts the framework used in previous IMANI Manifesto Assessment (IMMA) framework. Based on the identification of these key variables, a simple weighted average score is constructed as follows:

$$IMMA = 0.25*ECO + 0.15*HCI + 0.15*SOC + 0.20*INFRA + 0.25*GOV$$

Equation 1

The variables in the framework are defined as GOV = governance, ECO = Economy, HCI = Human capital Investment, SOC = Social Policy and INFRA = Infrastructural Development. $w_i = 1, 2, ..., 5$ are the assigned weights for each theme. The team assigns 25 percent weight for Governance, 25 percent weight for Economy, 15 percent for Human Capital Investment, 15 percent for Social Policy and 20 percent for Infrastructure Development. Weights are assigned based on the consideration of various studies including the eleven (11) dimensions of well-being as the compendium of OECD well-being indicators (OECD, 2011).

These dimensions are: Income and Wealth, Jobs and Earnings, Work-life and balance, Civic engagement and governance, Personal Security, Subjective well-being, Health Status, Social Connections, Education and Skills, Environmental quality and Housing. Moreover, the development and political economy literature is replete with empirical evidence that shows the relevance of quality of governance and a resilient economy in relation to the well-being of people (Acemoglu & Johnson, 2005; Fosu, Bates, & Hoeffler, 2006; Helliwell, Huang, Grover, & Wang, 2018). Additionally, without a stable economic and political environment; it would be virtually impossible for investment in education, social intervention and infrastructure to be sustained. Therefore, their superior importance must manifest.

Also, infrastructural development is vital for economic growth to translate to economic development. As such, governance and economy are of the most importance in the framework followed by Infrastructural development. This informed the determination of the weight differentials. It is difficult, however, to justify why, for instance, a particular value of 25% is chosen instead of 26% because unlike metrics such as Marginal Propensity to Consume (MPC), for example, which post-Keynesian economists have agreed to be 0.9 over the long run, empirical evidence is not conclusive on the degree of importance or weights of the selected variables. Therefore, it is vital to exercise informed discretion which we do here. Although the weights are chosen subjectively, the same weights would be used for different political parties over time in order to prevent bias against any particular party and ensure reliability of the method employed. Apart from making the weighted average method reliable by fixing the weights, it is also a valid method because it is a well-known and widely used because of its simplicity.
Substituting the weights, the framework becomes

\[ IMMA = 0.25*ECO + 0.15*HCI + 0.15*SOC + 0.20*INFRA + 0.25*GOV \]  \hspace{1cm} \text{Eqn. 2}  

This implies that if all promises under each theme are delivered, then we have

\[ IMMA = 0.25*1 + 0.25*1 + 0.15*1 + 0.15*1 + 0.20*1 = 1 \]  \hspace{1cm} \text{Eqn. 3}  

In the same way, if none of the promises are delivered so that the government scores 0 for each variable, then the government scores 0% on the IMANIFESTO framework. So, the IMANIFESTO scale ranges from 0% to 100%.

The spectrum below offers interpretation of the scores. The major challenge of the study was the promises themselves. Some promises were not found to be Specific Measurable Attributable Realistic and Time bound (SMART), a phenomenon which has been evident during previous manifesto assessments. Others were also quite vague. Still, others were not ambitious enough, for instance, only promising to continue an existing intervention. This made it difficult to hold government accountable for these promises without an element of subjectivity. But the subjectivity was guided by credible data and information from various Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs), and other external sources such as news media.

\begin{center}
\textbf{iManifesto Scoring Scale (0% to 100%)}
\end{center}

\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
Extremely Poor Progress & Poor Progress & Satisfactory Progress & Good Progress & Excellent Progress \\
\hline
\textcolor{red}{Fail} & \textcolor{orange}{Poor} & \textcolor{yellow}{Weak} & \textcolor{green}{Fair} & \textcolor{green!50!blue}{Good} & \textcolor{green!25!blue}{Very Good} & \textcolor{green!15!blue}{Excellent} \\
\hline
0 & 20 & 40 & 50 & 60 & 70 & 80 & 100 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\textit{Figure 1. iManifesto Scoring Scale}
**Scoring and Aggregation**

A broad matrix has been developed for all the goals under each theme and sub-themes. We scored them based on whether the goal has been implemented fully/partially or not at all. If the promise in the manifesto is fully implemented, we assign a score of 1 (i.e. 100 in percentage terms). If it is not initiated, we assign a score of zero. If project is initiated but not fully implemented, we assign a fraction and give a reason for the assigned score. It is crucial to state that to ensure objectivity and improve accuracy, the assessment involves the use of best practice procedures to ensure reliability and validity of the scores (Neuendorf, 2016; Riff, Lacy, Fico, & Watson, 2019).

First, the evidence-base has been obtained for each promise and different team members are allowed to score the promises. This is later corroborated to obtain the final result based on the evidence available.

### Simplified Scoring Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
<th>Manifesto Promise</th>
<th>Is it implemented? If yes, assign 1; if no, assign 0; if partial, assign a fraction</th>
<th>Reason/Evidence for the assigned Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Theme 1</td>
<td>Facilitate the passage of a Consumer Protection Law</td>
<td>facilitate the passage of a Consumer Protection Law</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This law is yet to be passed. It has been in parliament since 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 2</td>
<td>Petroleum</td>
<td>Empower local firms to play progressively active roles in the oil and gas value chain through capacity development, financing and partnership support</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>The contribution of local firms has been lethargic. As at 2019, only 105 out of the 701 registered local firms had contracts in the industry.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 3</td>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>The NPP will play an active part in the effort to create the African Continental Free Trade Area (AfCFTA).</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Under this administration Ghana successfully campaigned to host the continental secretariat of the AfCFTA, thus ensuring that Ghana will play a pivotal role in the formation of the free-trade area.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 2; Simplified Scoring Matrix*
Limitations of the Methodology

The major challenge of the study was the promises themselves. Many promises were not found to be Specific Measurable Attributable Realistic and Time bound (SMART). More specifically, some were vague. This made it difficult to hold government accountable for these promises without an element of subjectivity. Although the said subjectivity was reduced and guided by credible data and information from various Ministries Departments and Agencies (MDAs), it would have been at the barest minimum if the promises had been SMART. Another important dimension of this challenge was that promises which could have had quantifiable or ratio-scale-oriented indicators were only nominal or ordinal by nature. Thus, the assessment of those promises was limited to whether they were fulfilled or not rather than the extent to which they were fulfilled.

Overall Performance of the NPP Government

The overall performance of the NPP government based on the results from the key sectors as presented in Eqn. 3 is 48.78 percent. This depicts a satisfactory performance using the assessment framework.

Specifically, the NPP’s performance falls within the lower band of satisfactory progress. The government is behind time in implementing majority of its promises captured in the 2016 manifesto. From the total of 510 promises, majority of them have not been fully implemented and some have not been initiated at all. It is worth noting that this result reflects the extent of delivery of the promises and not an evaluation of the impact of the promises or the level of satisfaction of electorates. Figure 3 provides a graphical representation of the NPP government based on the IMMA Framework. The preceding sections provide a detailed discussion of the five (5) key sectors and the performance of the NPP government.
**Overall Performance of NPP Government**

The Current Performance of the NPP Government (48.78%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extremely Poor Progress</th>
<th>Poor Progress</th>
<th>Satisfactory Progress</th>
<th>Good Progress</th>
<th>Excellent Progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fail</td>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>Weak</td>
<td>Fair</td>
<td>Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 3: The Current Performance of the NPP Government*
ECONOMY (54.35%)

The growth of the Ghanaian economy depends largely on strong economic fundamentals and a reflection of the growth in the pocket of Ghanaians. It is on a case for a strong and buoyant economy that the NPP campaigned and presented their manifesto in 2016. The promises made by the NPP in 2016 have captured the establishment of institutions to foster stability and growth across the economy. The overall score of the NPP government based on the assessment of the delivery of promises under the economy theme is **54.35 percent**. This depicts a performance within the band of satisfactory progress. The performance under agriculture is **60 percent** which is within the upper band of satisfactory progress as was the case for tourism which scored **66.2 percent**. On the other hand, performance related to the general economy, trade and industry is **47.98 percent** which falls within the lower band of satisfactory progress. A detailed discussion of the results under the two (2) sub-themes have been presented as follows.

ECONOMY, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (47.98%)

The results of the assessment of the manifesto promises capturing the economy, trade and industry are presented in Figure 4. A total of 87 promises have been captured under economy, trade and industry. The results on the promises that are related to economic policy objectives are **50 percent** and the performance on macroeconomic stability is **69 percent** and economic management and taxation to production is **61 percent**. The government promises to achieve a double-digit GDP growth annually for its 4-tenure but has failed to achieve this as growth has been 8.5 percent in 2017, 6.3 percent in 2018, 6.7 percent in 2019 and is expected to be 6.1 percent in 2020. Similarly, the promise to reduce the cost of doing business has not been actualized. For instance, Ghana dropped in the ease of doing business index from 108th in 2017 to 118th in 2020.

---

1 Scores and rankings are: 2015 (65.24, 70th), 2016 (57.69, 114th), 2017 (58.82, 108th), 2018 (57.24, 120th), 2019 (60.4, 114th) and 2020 (60, 118th)
2 https://www.doingbusiness.org/en/rankings
In terms of promises related to fiscal discipline, the passing of the Fiscal Responsibility Act which establishes the Fiscal Council and the Financial Stability Council are notable. The formalisation of the economy has not been attained. The promise to stabilize the currency for the long term through prudent macroeconomic management, an increase in domestic production and an increase in exports is yet to be attained. The cedi has been reported to have lost 13 percent of its value in relation to the dollar in 2019 and is “poised for the worst decline since 2015 when it slumped 18 percent”.

On the abolishment of some taxes, the NPP government has made some progress. Examples include the abolishment of the 1 percent Special Import Levy, the 17.5 percent VAT/NHIL on selected imported medicines not produced locally, 17.5 percent VAT/NHIL on Financial Services, five percent VAT/NHIL on Real Estate sales and 17.5 percent VAT/NHIL on domestic airline tickets. However, an increase in tax compliance and the broadening of the tax base has not been fully achieved with implications for revenue mobilisation strategies. The NPP also captured in their manifesto to plug leakages in the administration of public finances.

They cited that from 2012 to 2014, GHS5.9 billion could not be accounted for. However, data from the Auditor General’s report suggests that these amounts during the NPP’s tenure are still high – 2017 (892 million) and 2018 (5.196 billion).

The performance for job creation is 39 percent and 49 percent for business financing and the cost of doing business. The result of the empowerment of local businesses is 44 percent and 30 percent for harmonization in industrial relations. In the area of entrepreneurship and business development, as well as, skills development for the industry, the government’s performance are 50 percent and 44 percent respectively. The 2016 manifesto captures the merger of the National Board for Small Scale Industries (NBSSI) and Rural Enterprises Project (REP) to consolidate public resources which have not yet been implemented.

The performance regarding external economic development needs to improve. The government scored 48 percent on export development 36 percent on trade and 5 percent on consumer protection. The government has not been able to deliver on its commitment to develop modern markets and retail infrastructure in every district to enhance domestic trade. Consumer protection issues are vital but have received less attention as the promise to pass the bill is yet to be realised. It should be noted that the bill was listed in January 2019 for consideration by the Legislature.

**TOURISM, CULTURE AND CREATIVE ARTS (66.19%)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Creative Arts</td>
<td>67.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>51.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism</td>
<td>84.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Ghana’s tourism, culture and creative arts sector was also a critical area of concern for the NPP. The NPP promised to expand the tourism sector in its manifesto, through investment, innovation, the pursuit of service excellence and meaningful partnerships. In specific terms, 10 promises were made for the tourism sector, 4 promises with regards to culture and 7 promises in the creative arts industry. Crucial commitments made included, aggressively developing tourist sites in Ghana to bring them to international standards, establish a creative arts fund to make available funds to modernize and develop the sector and promote made in Ghana goods.

Out of the 21 promises made under tourism, culture and creative arts, the government scored 66 percent on the iManifesto assessment tool, which signifies good progress. Notable commitments to the delivery of the NPP’s promises by the tourism industry include the commencement of work on the Marine Drive Tourism Investment Project in 2019, the back to Africa heritage which took place in early 2018, the reopening of the Hotel Hospitality and Catering Training Institute in July 2018 and the aggressive campaign towards the patronization of made in Ghana goods. However, the promise to construct modern large seating theatres in every regional capital in Ghana is yet to be implemented.

Regardless of this remarkable performance, Ghana ranked 115th out of 140 countries on the travel and tourism competitiveness index 2019. Out of the indicators for this index assessment, Ghana performed poorly on the tourist service infrastructure indicator, health and hygiene indicators. It would be more prudent for the government to develop aggressive measures towards the tourism sector infrastructure and hygienic services.

### AGRICULTURE (60%)

Agriculture is very significant to the Ghanaian economy although dominated by small landowners. It employs about 46 percent of the country’s total labour force. Averagely, its share of GDP from 2016 to 2018 was 20 percent, even though the cocoa subsector alone contributes about 10 percent of the agricultural sector’s GDP. Agriculture is also a major contributor to the country’s export earnings and a relevant source of inputs to Ghana’s manufacturing sector.

---

Regardless of the significant contribution of the agricultural sector to the Ghanaian economy, the country is still struggling to expand its agricultural export earnings beyond cocoa as well as reduce its over-dependence on imported foods\(^\text{10}\).

As part of the government's efforts to ensure the sustainability of Ghana's agricultural sector, the NPP government declared that in its four years in power, it would modernize agriculture, improve production efficiency, achieve food security and profitability for farmers. The NPP government also indicated that it would pursue a value-addition strategy, aimed at improving agro-processing and developing new and stable markets for Ghanaian products. To this end, 54 key promises were made under Ghana's agricultural sector. *The promises were under four themes, which consist of Improving Production Efficiency, Development of Products, Storage, Processing and Transport and Marketing. These four themes were subdivided to cover various sections in the agricultural sector and under each sub-division existed a number of key promises.* *The sub-sections under the improving production efficiency covered improved seeds and fertilizers, irrigation development, extension services, research, mechanization and commercial and farming block. Under the theme, development of products, the sub-sections covered crop production (non-traditional crops and cocoa), livestock, fisheries and poultry. There was no sub-division for the storage, processing and transport and marketing themes.*

The government scored **60 percent** in the agricultural sector using the iManifesto assessment tool, which implies satisfactory progress of the implementation of the campaign promises. A further assessment indicates that the government performed best on improved seeds and fertilizer. A strong performance is again registered on the developments of products. The government has executed 73 percent of its promises in the development of cocoa and 60 percent for non-traditional exports such as cashew, shea, oil palm and cotton. This confirms the government's significant commitments towards the country's agricultural sector. The comparatively weaker performances of **30 percent, 46 percent** and **44 percent** for poultry, fisheries and livestock respectively need attention.

In June 2019, the government launched rearing for food and jobs (RJF) as a module under the planting for food and jobs. This is to facilitate a competitive and more efficient livestock industry that will increase domestic meat production, reduce importation of livestock products and contribute to improving the livelihood of actors in the livestock value chain. However, the country is yet to witness if the rearing for food and jobs module will revive Ghana's livestock, fisheries and poultry sub-sectors.

\(^{10}\) [http://ebrary.ifpri.org/utils/getfile/collection/p15738coll2/id/133347/filesname/133660.pdf]
A number of key promises have either been fully achieved or partially achieved by the NPP government however, some key promises have also not been achieved. These include but not limited to instituting anti-dumping measures on poultry, supporting small and medium-scale agro-processing enterprises particularly women-owned to acquire the appropriate technology and basic processing machinery and continue to expand and upgrade the road infrastructure connecting farming communities to marketing centres remain unimplemented.

Although the sector’s score signifies satisfactory progress, it is still imperative for the government to develop more aggressive measures that would ensure that other sub-sectors within Ghana’s agricultural space are developed to the level of the country’s cocoa sector.
HUMAN CAPITAL INVESTMENT (39%)

Human Capital measures the skills, capacity and attributes of labour which influence productivity\(^\text{11}\). The investments in the form of education and health made into acquiring these qualities for production constitutes Human Capital Investment\(^\text{12}\). Citizens are able to reach full productivity when extensive investment is made into their human capital development rendering a much healthier and more educated people. The NPP government had an overall score of 39 percent in its attempt to educate and provide healthcare to the people of Ghana. Most of the promises under this sector centred on education with the popular slogan of “Free SHS.

EDUCATION (45%)

To achieve the objectives of education, the wellbeing and economic development of a country, it is very crucial to strengthen all levels of the country’s education system\(^\text{13}\). Prior to the 2016 general election, major political campaigns and promises of all political parties in Ghana were centred on the education sector with the NPP most popular slogan “Free SHS”. In 2017, the growth rate for the education sector was 6.3 percent from 2.3 percent in 2016, however, the sector’s growth decline to 3.9 percent in 2018\(^\text{14}\). The 2020 budget allocated GHS 13.3 billion to the education sector. This is a 3.3 percent increase from the 2019 allocation of GHS12.88 billion.

In 2016, the NPP manifesto on education had 32 promises grouped under 14 thematic areas including kindergarten, primary, Secondary, Technical and Vocational Education (STVE), management of schools, teachers, Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM), teaching of French, mission schools, tertiary education, among others. The government scores 42.5 percent on education. This is a satisfactory performance driven chiefly by the implementation of free Senior High School (SHS) redefinition of basic education to include SHS. The implementation of promises under the STEM theme has seen a satisfactory progress in the sector. The Ministry of Education reports in 2018 that it has trained 700 out of the targeted 1,400 teachers nationwide in Senior High Schools on the use of ICT to effectively

\(^{11}\) https://scholar.harvard.edu/files/goldin/files/goldin_humancapital.pdf
\(^{13}\) Joe and Osei-Poku (2012). Quality Education In Ghana: The Way Forward
In the area of tertiary education, there has been satisfactory progress so far with the restoration of teachers and nurses’ trainee allowance, ensuring Colleges of Education update their curricula. This has also seen the adjustment of training colleges to provide a 4-year degree programs as well as curriculum review of the Colleges.

Again, on Arabic education, the government had a good progress in implementation as the promise to restore the policy, and support Arabic/Islamic instructors with training and other incentives to motivate them to provide good training has been fulfilled. The government reports that through the implementation of this promise, it has recruited and deployed 3000 Arabic instructors to various Islamic schools. Also, the development of a curriculum for Arabic studies which will be an optional subject at JHS and SHS levels is ongoing to fulfil the promise of introducing Arabic as an optional language to be taught and examined at the JHS and SHS levels.

The government in order to fulfil promises under the ICT and Education area developed an ICT-based instruction for SHS 1 and 2 core-subjects which were rolled out in 70 Senior High Schools through the deployment of the iBox (an ICT package containing lesson texts, video, interactive exercises and practical). E-Learning Multi-Media laboratories have also been reported to have been installed in 242 Senior High Schools.

The free SHS promise was fully fulfilled, however, under the same theme, the manifesto promises to ensure each region has two state-of –the art technical and vocational institutions is yet to be achieved. The budget of 2018 and 2019 indicates construction of 20 modern TVET across the country. The 2020 budget increases this number to 32 in the medium-term.

### EDUCATION (45%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kindergarten</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>36.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary, Technical and Vocational...</td>
<td>87.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of schools</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>52.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEM Education</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching of French</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mission schools</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic Education</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counselling and Guidance</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Figure 6: Scores for Education](image-url)
The government is yet to deliver on its promises in the area of Guidance and counselling. The government is yet to deliver on the promise of constructing a manufacturing plant at the KNUST for the production of prototypes of inventions and creations of scientists and innovators in the country. The 2020 budget appears to put life in this promise. The establishment of Consultative Council of Researchers has not also been fulfilled. The promises that were under the thematic area of ‘teachers’ has also seen a poor progress in terms of implementation. Promises such as; to ensure teachers who upgrade their qualifications and skills are promoted promptly and that their salary increases take immediate effect has not been fulfilled as well as the promise to decentralization teachers’ recruitment and other document processing activities.

**HEALTH (33%)**

To attain universal health coverage requires addressing the health system in the country holistically and systematically. The health sector has seen increase in budget allocations from GHS 6.04 billion in 2019 to GHS 6.59 billion in 2020. In 2016, the sector grew by 4 percent, in 2017 it was 14.1 percent and growing at the rate of 22.1 percent in 2018.

Rescue and restructuring the National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS), addressing sector disparity and policy on cancer were the major thematic areas the NPP 2016 manifesto was centred on. The government scores 34.4 percent in achieving the promises in this sector. In an attempt to restructure the NHIS, NHIL Amendment bill was passed by Parliament and a technical team was also constituted in the restructuring process for recommendations for the sector. This led to the scrapping of the capitation grant and the Reform Agenda Strategy of the NHIS developed and implemented. In fulfilling the promise to utilize best technology in health insurance management, e-claims as well as mobile renewal and authentication of NHIS membership have been introduced. The innovations have led to the elimination of queues, delays, and bribery and corruption in the system. Also, to ensure the gradual shifting away from the central medical store management, Ministry of Health developed the warehousing strategy and this led to decentralizing the storage of 50 percent of all health commodities to its regional stores. Promises such as upgrading all existing District Hospitals where they exist, and where they do not, establishing one, establishing, in collaboration with the private sector wellness clinics at all levels of healthcare, working with the private sector to establish trauma centres within hospitals along the main highways, in order to facilitate medical treatment of citizens in cases of accidents have seen little or no implementation at all. Although the government promised to have district hospitals in all districts, there has been a general public outcry on the abandoning of some district hospitals started by their predecessor. Also, in the process of making Ghana the destination for health tourism in the ECOWAS region, efforts have been made with the development of medical tourism policy and the scoping of 11
facilities has been conducted to assess the potentials and basic requirements for the development of medical tourism in Ghana. The government has also made some attempt in investing in the expansion and equipping of medical schools to train more medical doctors by converting the Ho Regional hospital to a teaching hospital as well as completing some expansion works at the Tamale Teaching Hospital. A major campaign promises to restore Nursing trainees allowance has also been implemented.

![Figure 7: Scores for Health](source: Authors Construct)

The restoration has seen Health Trainee Allowance beneficiaries covering 54,840 trainees from 77 Public Health Training Institutions across the country in 2017/2018 academic year and so far government reports that a total of GHS 999,203,091 has been paid since the restoration of allowances for the teacher and nursing trainees from 2017\(^\text{15}\).

A promise to provide legislative, administrative and financial support for the implementation of the Mental Health Bill, control of non-communicable and neglected tropical diseases, organ transplantation and assisted reproduction has seen only little attention by deploying Mental Health Coordinators to regional and district hospitals across the country. On the promise of policy on cancer, there has been little progress on implementation as the promise to establish centres at all levels of the healthcare delivery system for screening, diagnosis, early detection has not been achieved. The promise to include cancer under the NHIS has been achieved. In 2020, an amount of GHS 15,000,000 has been allocated to the mental health subsector.

The NPP 2016 manifesto had some very popular promises which are very difficult to measure as there is no baseline for such measurements and very common across governments. Promises such as; promoting good nutrition and physical activity as a shared national value, making sure existing hospitals and clinics are adequately supplied with basic drugs, gloves, syringes, oxygen, vaccines, and anti-snake serum, coordinating with all government agencies to ensure that improved sanitation and waste management are pillars of their operations, etc. In conclusion, making Ghana the best destination for health tourism in the ECOWAS region should be encouraged as it has the potential to generate income for the country.
The 2016 manifesto of the NPP promised creating prosperity and equal opportunity for all, stressing on the need to make special provisions for everyone, especially for children, women, persons with disabilities and the elderly to have a fair chance of enjoying the benefits of a free and prosperous society through the strengthening of social protection. Social intervention programmes such as Livelihood Empowerment Against Poverty (LEAP), the Ghana School Feeding Programme (GSFP), Youth Employment Programme, Microfinance and Small Loans Centre (MASLOC) have received promises of revamping to create an all-inclusive society for Ghanaians, eradicate poverty in all forms, and minimize inequality among socio-economic groups.\textsuperscript{16}

The government scores \textbf{43.78 percent} for the social services sector. This is a satisfactory performance for the implementation of 57 promises made by the Akuffo-Addo administration. The assessment of the Ghana School Feeding Programme (GSFP) shows that the implementation of the sector's promises has been good with a score of 72 percent. Out of six campaign promises made under the GSFP, three (3) have been fully implemented with a government reported 34,028 caterers trained in food safety, hygiene and child nutrition with foodstuff consumed by the GSFP produced locally. The assessment shows a good score of 63 percent for Women's Empowerment and Children's Right sub-theme of the social sector promises. The NPP government has abolished market tolls and taxes paid by Kayayei. Amongst other activities, the government has developed a five-year strategic plan dubbed “Operation Get Off the Street Now for A Better Life”\textsuperscript{17} to further address the concerns of the Kayayei. However, promises on children’s welfare received relatively low attention with only the promise of strengthening regulations and reforming the adoption and foster care regime seeing full implementation.

\textsuperscript{16} In order to achieve SDGs 1-6

\textsuperscript{17} Government of Ghana (2019). Budget Statement and Economic Policy of Ghana for 2020 Financial Year
The government scores 33 percent on the implementation of LEAP as only one of the three (3) promises was fully implemented. A citizens’ expectations survey conducted in 2016 by IMANI Center for Policy and Education, named LEAP as one of the “Most Preferred Social Interventions that needs to be continued”. These results suggest that citizens expect more effort in implementing promises such as establishing a consistent and regular monthly disbursement plan and targeting female-headed households under LEAP. The government performed poorly (20 percent) in pursuing its promises targeted at Persons with Disabilities (PWDs). Only one of the eleven (11) promises made regarding the “Building of a fair and inclusive society” with the focus on PWDs was fully implemented (3 percent increase in Common Fund disbursements to Persons with Disabilities). There are lingering concerns raised by PWDs and other stakeholders about the neglect of special training schools for persons with disabilities, the lack of transparency in the distribution of the Common Fund to beneficiaries, the inability of PWDs to benefit fully from Free SHS due to the non-inclusive designs of structures which contravene section 6 of Ghana’s disability law (Act 715), and article 9 of the UN convention on right of persons with disabilities (CRPD).

Figure 8: Score for Social Sector
[source: Authors Construct]

The government scores 33 percent on the implementation of LEAP as only one of the three (3) promises was fully implemented. A citizens’ expectations survey conducted in 2016 by IMANI Center for Policy and Education, named LEAP as one of the “Most Preferred Social Interventions that needs to be continued”. These results suggest that citizens expect more effort in implementing promises such as establishing a consistent and regular monthly disbursement plan and targeting female-headed households under LEAP. The government performed poorly (20 percent) in pursuing its promises targeted at Persons with Disabilities (PWDs). Only one of the eleven (11) promises made regarding the “Building of a fair and inclusive society” with the focus on PWDs was fully implemented (3 percent increase in Common Fund disbursements to Persons with Disabilities). There are lingering concerns raised by PWDs and other stakeholders about the neglect of special training schools for persons with disabilities, the lack of transparency in the distribution of the Common Fund to beneficiaries, the inability of PWDs to benefit fully from Free SHS due to the non-inclusive designs of structures which contravene section 6 of Ghana’s disability law (Act 715), and article 9 of the UN convention on right of persons with disabilities (CRPD).

---

Again, the government made due on its commitments to pay off the outstanding contributions of Tier 2 pension funds. All the other five promises have not yet been implemented. Through the National Entrepreneurship and Innovation Plan (NEIP) under the Ministry of Business Development, the government has trained and funded about 1350 entrepreneurs\(^{19}\) between the ages of 18 and 35. With the 2018 budget indicating that young entrepreneurs of age 35 years and below, who start their own businesses, will through NEIP be granted tax holidays as well as tax credits abolished for businesses that hire young graduates from tertiary institutions up to five years, the government has kept up with the delivery of its promise, creating an environment for young entrepreneurs. On youth development alone, the government scores 48 percent in keeping its promises. Promises such as setting up a Youth Development Authority (YDA), the development of industrial parks in all regions targeting young Ghanaians, and the institution of a Buy-Local policy for Government agencies with regards to ICT amongst others should be implemented to the latter.

Majority of the campaign promises under sports development have been partially implemented. For instance, the government reports a 60 percent progress on the construction of the 10 youth and sports resource centres across the former 10 regions. The Navrongo Resource Center & Sports Stadium in the Upper East Region is also reported to be about 80 percent complete with promised sports stadia in Brong Ahafo and Upper West yet to be constructed; work on the sports fund is also reported to be progressing. A draft cabinet memo on the fund has been developed to be submitted to cabinet; the Sports Ministry is reported to be reviewing the implementation of the youth in sports module as of mid-2019. The government scored 31 percent for this subsector indicating weak progress.

In general, campaign promises that have not been implemented at all include but are not limited to: ensuring that the portion of DACF meant for persons with disability are disbursed through the decentralized district and regional offices of the NCPD; encouraging private institutions to reserve a quota of jobs that can be filled by Persons With Disabilities; targeting female-headed households for LEAP; providing the aged with a Freedom Pass to enable them ride for free on all public transportation; introducing a District Integrated Social Services programme for children, families and vulnerable adults to consolidate the relevant health, education, and justice systems, as well as all social protection programmes and setting up a Youth Development Authority (YDA) to harmonise and coordinate all government-sponsored youth initiatives and policies.

\(^{19}\) [http://neip.gov.gh/](http://neip.gov.gh/)
Infrastructure development within the context of the foregoing performance assessment focussed on four key areas mainly: The Energy sector, Lands and Natural Resources and Information Communication and Technology and Structural Development

ENERGY SECTOR (43.78%)

Ghana’s energy sector has witnessed significant progress since 2017. The government has pursued several energy supply security strategies such as expansion of generation capacity from 4,743MW in 2017 to 5,083MW in 2019 as a result of the completion of the Cenpower 340MW power plant, investment in other sources of supply such as solar and wind energy and improved domestic gas production to guarantee fuel supply security. In spite of these, progress, high capacity charges, high cost of take or pay commitments, power sector debt and lack of sustained electricity tariff reduction remain a challenge in the sector. The oil and gas sector has seen major boost post-ITLOS ruling in respect of Ghana-Cote d’Ivoire maritime disputes. Production levels have soared from 58,658,063.54 barrels per annum of crude oil in 2017 to 62,135,435.07 barrels of crude oil in 2018 from the Jubilee Field, TEN field and SGN field. Ghana is progressively implementing laws and policies relevant to developing a sound regulatory space. The first oil and gas round was completed in July 2019. An assessment of the process by IMANI on the contracting process highlighted several lapses in the bidding rounds such as lack of comprehensive data on the blocks, size of the acreage and absence of adequate transparency measures in both the competitive bid rounds and direct negotiations. Major international oil companies such as ExxonMobil, BP and China National Offshore Oil Corporation dropped out of the bid rounds. Furthermore, 10 IOC’s that initially expressed interest to participate the competitive bid rounds opted for the blocks reserved for direct negotiation. Other developments in the sector include; appraisal activities and submission of Plan of Development (POD) for the Deep Water Tano Cape Three Points (DWT/CTP) by Aker Energy and success by Springfield SEP, in finding oil after drilling the Afina-1x well in the West Cape Three Points (WCTP) Block 2. Taking cognizance of global economic crisis, low carbon specifications in Germany, China-America trade wars, attack on Saudi’s refinery facility, the rising production in the US and the International Maritime Organization’s new sulphur content...
specification of 50ppm, oil price are likely to fall below US$50/barrel, and thus affect Ghana’s oil revenue projections\textsuperscript{20}.

The New Patriotic Party made a total 36 promises with regards to the energy sector which cover the power, oil and gas sector. The government scored 43.78 percent in the implementation of its promises in the sector. According to the iManifesto assessment framework, this is a satisfactory performance.

\textbf{Energy Sector (43.78\%)}

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textbf{Petroleum}: 44.71
  \item \textbf{Power}: 45.26
\end{itemize}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{energy_sector_score.png}
\caption{Energy Sector Score}
\end{figure}

\textit{[source: Authors Construct]}

The NPP government promised to end “dumsor” in the short term through injecting liquidity into the sector, debt restructuring, and securing firm commitments for the supply of fuel. As part of the government’s strategies towards resolving “dumsor”, the government established the ESLA Plc in 2017 as a special purpose vehicle to raise long term debt to resolve the debt crisis unsettling the energy sector. The ESLA Bond was issued in 2017 and has raised approximately GH¢6billion as at 29\textsuperscript{th} July 2019\textsuperscript{21}.

\textsuperscript{20} \url{https://oilprice.com/Energy/Crude-Oil/Oil-Could-Fall-To-40-If-OPEC-Fails-To-Deepen-Cuts.html} [Accessed 09-12-19, 21:30GMT]
Furthermore, the government through Ghana National Petroleum Corporation supported the completion of the on-shore receiving facility funded by ENI Ghana, and continued work on the Takoradi-Tema interconnector to ensure consistent supply of gas for power plants in Tema. The government also moved the Karpowership Osman Khan 450MW powership to Takoradi to utilize gas from the SGN field would help guarantee fuel supply for power generation.

The government is yet to consistently implement reduced electricity tariffs promise consistently. The government reduced electricity tariffs in 2018 by 17.5percent for residential, 25percent for special load tariff and 30% for industry as a result of the revenue projection of power utilities. However, the government increased electricity tariff by 11.17percent and 5.94percent in 2019 based on the need to improve the revenue and cover the cost of power utilities. In keeping with the government's promise, electricity tariffs were reduced but the overall absolute reduction is less than 5% between 2018 and 2019. This raises questions as to the rationale behind the tariff reduction in 2018.

The NPP has made good progress in the execution of the technical audits on power projects leading to savings of 13percent on the cost of the AMERI Power Purchase Agreement, and 31percent on the CENIT PPA. The government has converted the CENIT agreement to a Take and Pay contract, deferred 8 and terminated 2 power purchase agreements. Nonetheless, an assessment of the Institute of Energy Security\(^\text{22}\) added that Ghana will gain marginally from the re-negotiated AMERI deal because the new deal offers high electricity tariffs in the long-run.

The NPP government delivered on the promise of developing and implementing an Energy Sector Financial Restructuring and Recovery Plan (ESFRRP), which resulted in the implementation of the least-cost fuel procurement policy leading to the movement of the Karpowership Osman Khan to utilize the excess contracted gas from the SGN field. Progress was made in the area renewable energy with the completion of 45kw mini-hydro project in the Tsatsadu River, and completion of contractual agreement for the exploration of tidal and wind energy at Ada. In spite of these progress, the government is yet to improve the share of renewable energy in the generation mix. The share of renewable energy in the generation mix currently stand at 0.1percent

The conduct of the government with regards to ensuring transparency in management of oil and gas resources suggest that they have followed the Petroleum Act, 2016 Act 919 and the Petroleum Regulation,2018 LI 2359, other legislation and policies. The Accelerated Oil and Gas Capacity Programme (AOGC), commissioned in 2017, served as a conduit through which the

NPP was able to deliver on its promise to invest in education and skill of Ghanaians in the oil and gas industry. The programme has so far trained 127 people in welding and fabrication. The government delivered on its promise of redeeming debts owed to Bulk Distributing Companies. The government paid all of its debt of GHC906million (US$ 158,707,852.82) owed BDC’s from 2012-2018 in 2019.

Despite the above progress, the NPP is yet to expand Tema Oil Refinery’s daily capacity and “to [guarantee] that crude oil produced in Ghana is refined here to add value to our oil and to build a petrochemical industry as an important growth pillar for the economy”. TOR has a refinery capacity of 45,000bopd and currently refines 14,000bopd on a tolling basis. TOR has signed an agreement with Woodfield Energy Resources to refine 11million barrels of crude oil, which will see firm operation of the refinery.

The government is yet to implement its promise of guaranteeing the independence of the Ghana National Petroleum Corporation to focus on its core mandate to undertake exploration, development, production and disposal of petroleum on behalf of the State. The Public Interest and Accountability Committee 2018 annual reports revealed that GNPC granted a credit facility of US$50million to the Ministry of Finance.

This credit according to 2019 PIAC mid-year review is unpaid as a result of the directive from the Ministry of Finance requesting the Corporation to expunge the amount from its books, on the ground that per the Earmarked Funds Capping and Realignment Act, 2017 (Act 947), the Minister of Finance is empowered to cap all earmarked funds at twenty-five percent of tax revenues. The Ministry indicated that the Government had not retained GNPC’s flows thus far with the view to offsetting the US$50 million loan.

These activities affect the ability of GNPC to undertake its core mandate and grow into an independent oil and gas company capable of owning blocks outside Ghana like Shell and China National Offshore Oil Corporation. The government is yet to capitalize on the oil revenues allocated to rail development to construct the Accra to Kumasi and Paga rail line. The government has only undertaken feasibility studies concerning the railway development in the Eastern Corridor.

The government’s inability to implement a laid down procurement plan backed by law to ensure effective process of procuring power plants, promote rapid adoption of solar for government buildings, improve the capacity and independence of Public Utility Regulatory Commission and Energy Commission resulted in the satisfactory performance of the government in the energy sector. The government’s ability to restructure the power market, promote green energy share in the power market and promote local content in the supply of solar panels can boost its performance in the future. Furthermore, for the government to see good progress in the fulfilment of its promises in the energy sector, the government must aim
to turnaround of Western Region as an oil and gas hub, guarantee the independence of GNPC, support indigenous companies to participate in the oil and gas sector, address macro-economic challenges affecting the effective implementation of the Petroleum Price Deregulation Policy and ensure effective implementation of the Petroleum Revenue Management Act, 2011 Act 815 (amended in 2015).

**Lands and Natural Resources (54.6%)**

The lands and natural resource sector covers forestry, minerals and land issues. Since 2017, the government has reiterated its commitment to clamping down the operations of illegal mining and ensuring small-scale mining is operated in an environmentally friendly manner. The government scored 54.6 percent signifying a strong satisfactory progress in delivering the pledges on lands and natural resources.

The government delivered the pledges made on improving reforestation through the procurement of seedlings. The government reported that, through the Forestry Commission it increased the seedlings for the national plantation programme from 4.1 million seedlings to 13.3 million seedlings. The government also made progress in improving ecotourism through collaboration between the Forestry Commission and the Ministry of Tourism to designated the Shai Hills, Kakum National Park in Central Region, Ankasa Forest Reserve in Western Region, Bomfobiri Wildlife Sanctuary in the Ashanti and Shai Hills Resource Reserve in the Greater Accra Region, as eco-tourism sites.

The government reported progress in implementation of sustainable water management strategies such as planting of trees along the banks of rivers. The government implemented its pledges on providing high quality seedlings to farmers, improved crop rotation and pest management.

The government made significant progress in the area of minerals development. It initiated the "operation vanguard" programme to fight illegal mining that had destroyed water bodies and environment. The implementation of the programme is reported to have resulted in the improvement in water quality in some mining communities, ensured small-scale mining is operated under an environmentally sustainable manner. In addition, the government revived Anglo Gold Ashanti to begin operations in 2018. The government made progress in developing the mining cadastre to an online portal that ensured disclosure on mineral rights allocation. The NPP government also made progress in the implementation of the Alternative Livelihood Project to curb environmental degradation and unemployment associated mining
communities. The government reports\textsuperscript{23} that the alternative livelihood project created 7,500-10,000 jobs between 2017 and 2019.

The government made progress in the implementation of the promises with regards to land administration implementing the first phase of the Ghana Enterprise Land Information System to streamline all land title registration and data protection. The government reportedly launched a pilot of this programme areas like Accra, East Legon and Dansoman.

Notwithstanding the progresses made, the government is yet to develop and implement a mineral revenue management law to support transparency and accountability in the spending of mineral revenues. The government is expanding forest reserves through the national plantation programme but the mechanism for demarcating the forest reserves have not improved to meet the rate at which the reserves. The government has not supported the honey, bamboo and rattan industry.

The government is yet to reduce the turnaround time at the land’s commission to 30days in processing titles. In addition, the government has not been able to attract investors to support the development of industrial and business parks where they are needed most. Also, the government is yet to free some public lands to support entrepreneurial development and facilitate the reduction in cost of land.

**STRUCTURAL DEVELOPMENT (47.76\%)**

Infrastructure development within the context of the foregoing performance assessment focus on four key areas mainly: *transport infrastructure, housing, management of water resources and information communication and technology*. Significant investment in the road sector include the construction of the Pokuase Interchange and the Tema Motorway Interchange. The disbursement of the first tranche of the US$2billion Sinohydro agreement opened up space for government expenditure in addressing infrastructure deficit.

Automation and expansion in the size of ports and harbour to a dredged depth of 16.0 has reduced transaction time and quality of service at the ports have resulted in an increase in transit traffic from 862,377 tonnes to 1,043,771 tonnes in 2017. The Meridian Port Services (MPS) investment of US$1.5 billion is expected to improve capacity of the terminal to 3.5 twenty-foot equivalent unit (TEU), create four berths and accommodate the modern containership. The railway sector has seen a major boost since 2017 when the sector was selected as part of the priority areas for the Annual Budget Funding Amount spending from 2017 to 2021. The successes registered by the sector include the completion of the construction of the sub-urban railway line from Sekondi to Takoradi via Kojokrom which consist of 10.1km double track and 4.5km single track lines, the construction of 85km railway line from the Tema Port to link the Volta Lake via the Akosombo Port, feasibility studies and search for strategic partner to develop the Eastern Corridor Rail lines.

The implementation of the “operation Vanguard” to resolve the negative impact of illegal mining on water bodies has led to improvement in water quality from an index of 49.3 (indicating poor quality) to 53.0 in 2019 (indicating fairly good quality).
The establishment of Accra ICT parks and Rural Telephony projects have improved small and medium enterprises access to information and enabled more network coverage. The implementation of e-transform, e-government and the collaboration between National Information Technology Agency and Lebara Network has improved information sharing and data security among MDA’s and MMDA’s. The progress with execution of housing for security agencies and affordable housing projects have contributed to resolving the challenges associated with housing deficit in Ghana.

An assessment of the government’s performance against the iManifesto framework shows a sector performance of **47.75 percent**. This indicates satisfactory progress in the implementation of the promises on infrastructural development.

The government is yet to implement its promise on creating a National Asset Protection Project to keep track of all state asset and ensure regular audits of the assets. The Ghana Asset Management Corporation bill has been developed and approved by cabinet but has not been laid in parliament for reading, review and subsequent passage. It is the passing of this bill into law that will see the NAPP materialize.

The government is yet to deliver on its promise of providing light rail systems to minimize traffic congestion in major cities. The 2019-2020 medium term expenditure framework shows that feasibility studies on this project has commenced. The government is yet to deliver on its promise of constructing the Eastern corridor rail lines that will ensure the effective utilization of the Boankra Inland Port that has been dormant since 2007. The Tema-Akosombo railway link to ease congestion at the ports has not been delivered.

The government promised to review the location for fuel stations along the high ways to reduce accidents on the high way. The government is yet to deliver on this promise as fuel stations are continuously sited along the major roads in the city and highways. For example the Atomic fuel spillage that claimed more than 70 lives in 2018 lays credence to the inefficiencies in the government’s approach to dealing with this problem.

The government is yet to implement the promise on ensuring the proper road networks to improve access to health services. Bad road network continues to be a challenge affecting effective delivery of health service in areas such as Upper Denkyira and Sissala West District.

---


Moreover, the government has not implemented its promise on ensuring timely maintenance activities on the roads.

The government promised to provide regular access to water for district and regional hospitals. The government is yet to deliver on this promise as most district hospitals and regional health facilities face water supply challenges. This has the tendency to affect the quality of healthcare delivery to deprived districts. The government is yet to deliver on its promise to ensure that all government buildings have solar panel and water collection techniques. Majority of government buildings continue to rely on the national grid for power supply and there are no government budget commitments towards implementation this promise. The government is yet to deliver on its promise to construct a port at James Town and Keta. The government has issued executive instrument to delineate an area for the construction of the ports but actual work has not begun on the construction for port for the communities. The promise on constructing an in-land port at Buipe is yet to be implemented by the government.

The government promised to register every Ghanaian on the National Identification card under the National Identification Authority. As at 2019, the government has registered 4.5million people across the country. Thus, the probability of registering the 30million Ghanaians in the next year remains a challenge. The implementation of 9% communication service tax has resulted in a rise in the data and airtime charges. The government is yet to fulfil its promise on reducing taxes data charges.

In spite of the backlog of promises yet to be fulfilled, the government has made progress in several areas. The government has delivered on the construction of some major roads such as Trakwa-Bogoso-Ayamfuri roads, Agona junction-Elubo, Kasoa interchange and ancillary works in 2017. In 2018 the projects in-progress included: 3-tier interchange, 3-tier tema motorway interchange, asphalt overlay on the Manhyia and Bantama overlay. Projects completed in 2018 were construction of oil and gas enclave roads-(Construction of 10km road along the pipe line including the Amazure bridge), rehabilitation of Tarkwa–Bogoso–Ayamfuri Road (94.4km): Tarkwa Bogoso Section (30km), construction of two lane underpass to link Spintex and East Legon. In 2019, commencement of work on the Obetsebi-Lamptey interchange, reconstruction and rehabilitation of 50km of selected Road.

The government has made progress in improving public transport across the country. In 2019, government constructed the public transport terminals at Atous. In addition, government procured a total of 100 new intercity buses to augment the fleet of the Metro Mass Transit Limited (MMT). In 2018, the Government Technical Training Centre (GTTC) in collaboration with the Private Sector trained 415 drivers including 77 Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) drivers, 285 MMT drivers and 53 drivers from Corporate Institutions. Government procured 50No. New intercity buses to augment the fleet of the Metro Mass Transit Limited. A contract was
awarded for the acquisition of additional 50No. buses. Similarly, processes for the supply of 100No. New intercity buses for the Intercity STC Coaches Limited were completed. Additionally, in an effort to promote the participation of women in transport service provision, a total number of 72 women were trained as bus drivers and will soon be posted to commence Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) operations in Kumasi.

The government continued expansion works at the Tema and Takoradi ports. The government implemented a paperless transaction platform that has reduced transaction time and resulted in an increase in the transit traffic. The government has collaborated with Ibis Tek to invest US$370million to construct a multi-purpose terminal at the Takoradi port in 2018. The government continued 100m quay project as part of the first phase of the Dry Bulk Jetty was completed as part of the programme to make the Takoradi port an oil and gas hub to accommodate bigger vessels. Additionally, the first two berths out of the 4 berths designed for expanding container handling of the Tema port was completed and operationalized. Furthermore, the Dry Bulk Jetty with a total capacity of 800m has been completed in 2019. Despite the significant investment in the maritime industry by the government, the reduction in port charges have been politically motivated. For example, the Vice President revealed the decision of the Economic Management Team to reduce import duties by 50 percent in April at the town hall meeting.

The government has implemented the removal of 17.5 percent value added tax on domestic airlines. The recent rise in patronage for domestic flights and rise in the number of domestic airlines from 1 in 2017 to 3 in 2019 can be attributed to the incentives provided by the government to the sector.

The “Operation Vanguard was launched in 2017 to fight the menace of illegal mining and its harm on water resources. Successful implementation of the project has resulted in improved water quality from an index of 49.0 to 53.0. The government supported the development of water treatment projects in Wa Water Supply Project and completed the Cape Coast Water Supply Project, Essakyir Water Supply Project and Akim Oda, Akwatia and Winneba Water Supply Project and other expansion project.

In 2018, the Ministry of Communication through Ghana Investment Fund for Electronic Communication (GIFEC) established 400 telephony sites to provide voice signals to 2,000 underserved and unserved communities to bridge the digital divide. In 2019, GIFEC will deploy additional 600 telephony sites to provide voice signals to 1,800 communities where coverage is limited or non-existent due to the inability of existing license operators to expand their networks. Additionally, the rural telephony project seeks to extend mobile network services to all areas where access is currently unavailable, and where existing licenced operators are unwilling or unable to provide services for commercial or other constraints.
The ultimate objective of this is to achieve 100 percent network coverage throughout Ghana. The NPP government abolished the 5% VAT on real estate sales to boost the real estate industry.

**SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND ENVIRONMENT (29.25%)**

In the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, the importance of science, technology, and innovation in driving economic development cannot be underestimated. In Ghana, the development agenda in these areas are meant to be actualised through the Ministry of Environment, Science, Technology and Innovation. It is by no means a coincidence that the 2016 manifesto of the NPP captured science, technology, innovation and environment. The results of a total of 20 promises assessed using the IMMA framework has been presented in Figure 8. The performance is poor at **29.25 percent**.

![Figure 11: Scores for Science, Technology, Innovation and Environment](source: Authors Construct)

In line with general issues regarding science and technology as outline in the manifesto, the government scores 50 percent. The government has not been able to achieve the 1.5 percent of GDP investment in science, technology and innovation with implications for stimulating science and technology development.
Only a commitment of increasing investment from 0.25 percent of GDP to 1 percent has been made\(^{26}\). The promise of regional technology parks is yet to be realised and technology education also show poor performance. For instance, promise to support the national policy of achieving 60:40 student ratio for the sciences as compared to humanities, has not been achieved. It is worth noting that the National Science, Technology and Innovation (STI) policy has been revised on the assumption of office by this government but does not make provision for this\(^ {27}\).

In terms of environmental concerns, most of the promises are not SMART. The government scores 37 percent in the area of energy and waste management. The NPP promised to build power plants which will use combustible domestic and industrial waste to generate electricity. There are indications of some level of efforts in the area but much is expected to upscale it for larger use\(^ {28}\). Policies on agriculture and land use have not been implemented to capture the promises made resulting in a score of 18 percent. The promise to improve research and development to enhance land use is undermined by the nonexistence of a land-use policy\(^ {29}\). There is also a promise to map out the soil structure and composition of the country using science and technology which has not been achieved. Research efforts to enhance land-use systems is still low which undermines the commitment of the government to enhance land use. It is estimated that “over the next 15 years, the global economy will require an estimated $89 trillion in infrastructure investments across cities, energy, and land-use systems, and $4.1 trillion in incremental investment for the low-carbon transition to keep within the internationally agreed limit of a 2-degree Celsius temperature rise.”\(^ {30}\) The promises relating to land use are vital for the countries efforts to address climate change. Water and environment efforts have also been low with a score of 33 percent. A promise to facilitate research and development in technologies for water desalination is yet to be implemented.

\(^{26}\) https://www.ghanaweb.com/GhanaHomePage/business/Cabinet-increases-funding-for-scientific-research-to-1-of-GDP-803925
\(^{28}\) https://www.afrik21africa/en/ghana-germany-provides-funding-for-waste-to-energy-power-generation/
\(^{29}\) https://www.businessghana.com/site/news/business/199774/Ghana-needs-a-land-use-policy
Great nations are built on good governance. The formulation and implementation of prudent policies within the Governance space are crucial to ensuring the active participation of the citizenry in both the economic and political activities of the nation. On the broad theme of Governance, the New Patriotic Party (NPP) made a total of 80 promises to the people of Ghana in their 2016 Manifesto. Heading into their fourth year in power, this administration has managed to fulfil 46.2 percent of its campaign promises, a marginally acceptable result. From the analyses of the government’s performance concerning the promises made in the area of governance, it is evident that this administration has invested great time and effort into the implementation of its flagship promises. This a theme observed in some the other sectors assessed in this report.

**Governance (46.2)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chieftaincy</td>
<td>81.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>75.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>60.58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious Affairs and Civil Society</td>
<td>56.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance, Corruption and Public Accountability</td>
<td>23.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government</td>
<td>22.22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 12: Score for Governance*

[source: Authors Construct]

---

Governance, Corruption and Public Accountability

In 2016, the New Patriotic Party (NPP) ran their election campaign on a platform that promised to clean up the of perception of rampant and widespread corruption the nation had garnered for itself under the previous NDC government, and heighten the level of transparency within the governance structures of this nation.

Three years on, the NPP government has unfortunately not been able to improve the perceived level of corruption and mismanagement in the country. According to Transparency International's Corruption Perceptions Index, Ghana has recorded two of its highest-ever rankings within the first two years of this administration. Meanwhile, other West African nations such as Côte d'Ivoire and Senegal have been named amongst the ‘most improved’ nations on earth over the same period.

“In the last few years, several countries experienced sharp declines in their CPI scores, including Burundi, Congo, Mozambique, Liberia and Ghana. - Transparency International (2018)“

---

According to the Centre for Democratic Development (CDD-Ghana)-Afrobarometer report (December 2019), More than half (53 percent) of Ghanaians believe that the level of corruption in the country has risen in the past year alone; a 17 percentage-point increase compared to 2017\textsuperscript{34}.

From IMANI’s Assessment of the government’s performance on Governance, Corruption and Public Accountability it is unsurprising that the NPP scored 23.6 percent. This administration was able to successfully implement just under a quarter of its Governance campaign promises in the first three years. Despite this, the Government was able to chalk down some significant achievements; Chief amongst-which, was the setting up of the Office of the Special Prosecutor and the passage of the long-awaited Right to Information (RTI) Bill. On the other hand, some key initiatives left incomplete are; the resurrection of the People’s Assemblies from the Kufour era, the reformation of asset declaration laws and the establishment of a corruption reporting website under the Whistle Blower’s Act of 2006.

In 2016, IMANI released a citizens’ expectations report which aimed to ascertain the aspects of government policy that the average Ghanaian considered to be the most important to him/her in the run-up to the general election. Out of the themes subsumed under Governance, the anti-corruption policy (i.e. “Reduction of Corruption” and “Recovery of Money Lost to Corruption”) ranked remarkably high in the thoughts of citizens \textsuperscript{35}. The unsatisfactory performance of this administration on this issue is concerning.

**Local Government**

Under the ‘Local Government’ sub-theme, this administration scored even worse, with a 22.2 percent implementation rate. The NPP has not delivered on key promises such as the pledge to increase the allowances paid to assembly members and the expedited passage of the Municipal Finance Bill (\textit{although this Bill is currently under review}). This government appeared to have been gathering momentum towards the accomplishment of one of its flagship pledges; to oversee the public election of Metropolitan, Municipal and District Chief Executives MMDCE’s. However, the President recently called a halt to the entire process, by citing the lack of a broad, national consensus as the reason for removal of the Bill for the amendment of article 243(1) Constitution from Parliament.


\textsuperscript{35} IMANI Centre for Policy and Education (2016). Aligning the Promises of Political Parties with the expectations of the Ghanaian Voter. https://imaniafrica.org/2016/10/05/imani-pre-election-survey-results-aligning-promises-political-parties-expectations-ghanaiian-voter/
The passage of this Bill not only would have satisfied the NPP’s 2016 promise, but would have also satisfied one of the key recommendations of the now Eight (8) year old Constitutional Review Committee (CRC) report.36

Security and Foreign Affairs

On the brighter side, the NPP government has performed admirably in the areas of Security and Foreign Affairs where it scored 60.6 percent and 75 percent respectively. On Security, this administration has shown its continued commitment to the National Barracks Regeneration Programme and the insurance of safety on roads and highways through the sustained deployment of additional police personnel. Ghana has been renounced for being one of the safest nations on the sub-continent, and under the Akuffo-Addo led government this remains the true. Currently, Ghana is the 4th safest nation in Africa.37

Concerning foreign Affairs, this administration has performed admirably. Under the leadership of this administration, Ghana won the bid to host the continental secretariat for the newly established African Continental Free-Trade Area (AfCFTA). This will invariably go some way to strengthen the status of Ghana as a major powerhouse within the African Union (AU) as the NPP promised in their 2016 manifesto. Also, the “Year of Return” campaign has been a success. In 2019, the nation has seen the influx many of foreign nationals into the county, especially those of African descent, with many more expected to arrive in Ghana in December and January (2020). This will increase Ghana’s national income earnings from tourism and if these efforts are sustained beyond 2020, the campaign may have the potential to transcend the possible monetary gains and galvanise the collective identity of Ghanaians and Africans worldwide. With that said, the government did not fulfil its promise to oversee the passage of the Representation of The People’s Law, 1992 (ROPAL) to finally allow Ghanaians in the diaspora exercise their franchise.

**Chieftaincy, Religious Affairs and Civil Society**

The combined campaign promises under this subsector that have been either fully or partially implemented lead to a score of **70.83 percent**. Prior to the 2016 election, traditional leaders complained about the non-payment of their royalties. With the implementation of the promise to ensure the prompt payment of royalties, due traditional leaders, such complaints have become a rarity.

The Ministry for Chieftaincy and Religious Affairs in collaboration with the National House of Chiefs, begun the process of digitizing records for the afforestation and greening of Ghana with the support of the Forestry Commission. This move facilitated the government’s strategy and promise of engaging traditional leaders in the protection of water bodies and conservation of the environment. The NPP government demonstrated commitment to religious organizations by reaching a consensus and beginning site work on the controversial national cathedral. On the promise of cooperating and collaborating with civil society, there have been many such collaborations across sectors to improve governance and enhance the well-being of Ghanaians.
References


GHANA STATISTICAL SERVICE, (2019). STATISTICS FOR DEVELOPMENT AND PROGRESS REBASED 2013-2018 ANNUAL GROSS DOMESTIC PRODUCT. AVAILABLE AT:


HTTP://VISIONOFHUMANITY.ORG/APP/UPLOADS/2019/06/GPI-2019-WEB003.PDF

HTTP://WWW.STATSGHANA.GOV.GH/GSSMAIN/STORAGE/IMAGE/MARQUEEUPDATER/ANNUAL_2013_2018_GDP_APRIL%202019%20EDITION.PDF


INSTITUTE FOR ECONOMICS AND PEACE, GLOBAL PEACE INDEX (2019).

INSTITUTE OF ENERGY SECURITY. (2018). PRESS RELEASE: REVISED AMERI DEAL; A RIP OF TAXPAYERS MONEY.

HTTPS://MEDIA.PEACEMONLINE.COM/DOCS/201807/74933991_806471.PDF

JOE AND OSEI-POKU (2012). QUALITY EDUCATION IN GHANA: THE WAY FORWARD.


MINISTRY OF FINANCE (2017). BUDGET STATEMENT AND ECONOMIC POLICY OF GHANA FOR 2017 FINANCIAL YEAR

IMANI
Center for Policy & Education

IMANI 2019: An Assessment of the NPP Government’s Election Promises (2017-2020)
MINISTRY OF FINANCE (2017). BUDGET STATEMENT AND ECONOMIC POLICY OF GHANA FOR 2018 FINANCIAL YEAR
MINISTRY OF FINANCE (2019). BUDGET STATEMENT AND ECONOMIC POLICY OF GHANA FOR 2020 FINANCIAL YEAR
https://www.mofep.gov.gh/sites/default/files/budget-statements/2019-Mid-Year-Budget-
Statement.pdf
My Joy Online. The plight of persons living with disabilities in Ghana (December, 2018). Available at:
https://www.myjoyonline.com/opinion/2018/december-3rd/the-plight-of-persons-living-with-
disabilities-in-ghana.php
NEW PATRIOTIC PARTY (NPP) MANIFESTO FOR ELECTION (2016)
PWC, (2018). DOING BUSINESS AND INVESTING IN GHANA. AVAILABLE AT:
SCHUMPETER, J. A. (1942). CAPITALISM, SOCIALISM AND DEMOCRACY. NEW YORK: HARPER.
THE CONSTITUTIONAL REVIEW COMMISSION; FROM A POLITICAL TO A DEVELOPMENTAL CONSTITUTION (2011).
UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME (UNDP). SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs) (2015-
2030). RETRIEVED FROM;
https://www.unpd.org/content/dam/undp/library/corporate/brochure/SDGs_Booklet Web En.pdf
WORLD BANK GROUP, (2018). 3RD GHANA ECONOMIC UPDATE AGRICULTURE AS AN ENGINE OF GROWTH AND JOBS CREATION. AVAILABLE AT:
Economic-Update-3-13-18-web.pdfInternational